

Library Note

The Case for Arts Education in Schools

On 27 November 2014, the House of Lords is scheduled to debate the following motion:

"that this House takes note of the case for arts education in schools"

Information presented in this Note has been compiled to provide background reading for Members ahead of the debate.

Commentators have stated that the value of the arts and culture, both in schools and more generally, is difficult to quantify. However, despite this, several studies using an evidence based approach have been conducted on the issue. A selection of these studies is summarised in this Note, together with an outline of government activity relating to arts education, the Opposition position on this issue and a brief synopsis of sector opinion on government reforms to arts education in schools.

Thomas Brown 20 November 2014 LLN 2014/037



Table of Contents

1. Introduction	l
I.I Definition	I
I.2 Value of the Creative Sector to the UK Economy	I
I.3 Number of Students Studying for Arts GCSE Qualifications	2
2. Reports on the Effects of Arts Education	3
2.1 National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education Report, 1999	3
2.2 National Foundation for Educational Research Report, 2000	4
2.3 United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation Report, 2003	5
2.4 National Foundation for Educational Research Report, 2005	7
2.5 Third Sector Research Centre Report, 2013	9
2.6 Arts Council England Report, 2014	9
3. Government Activity	11
3.1 Cultural Education Policy Paper	11
3.2 National Curriculum	13
3.3 Qualification Changes	13
4. Opposition Position	16
5. Sector Opinion	18

I. Introduction

Commentators have stated that the value of the arts and culture, both in schools and more generally, is difficult to quantify. However, despite this, several studies using an evidence based approach have been conducted on the issue. A selection of these studies is summarised in this Note, together with an outline of government activity relating to arts education, the Opposition position on this issue and a brief synopsis of sector opinion on government reforms to arts education in schools.

I.I Definition

Encyclopaedia Britanica defines 'the arts' as follows:

The arts, also called fine arts, modes of expression that use skill or imagination in the creation of aesthetic objects, environments, or experiences that can be shared with others.

Traditional categories within the arts include literature (including poetry, drama, story, and so on), the visual arts (painting, drawing, sculpture, etc), the graphic arts (painting, drawing, design, and other forms expressed on flat surfaces), the plastic arts (sculpture, modeling), the decorative arts (enamelwork, furniture design, mosaic, etc), the performing arts (theatre, dance, music), music (as composition), and architecture (often including interior design).2

The Government has defined 'the arts', in an educational context, as comprising art and design, music, dance, drama and media arts.3

1.2 Value of the Creative Sector to the UK Economy

In January 2014, the Government stated that the UK's creative industries were worth £71.4 billion per year to the UK economy, or £8 million an hour. Other findings of the Creative Industries Economic Estimates were:

- GVA (gross value added) of the creative industries was £71.4 billion in 2012 and accounted for 5.2 percent of the UK economy.
- GVA of the creative industries has increased by 15.6 percent since 2008, compared with an increase of 5.4 percent for the UK economy as a whole.
- GVA of the creative industries increased by 9.4 percent between 2011 and 2012, higher than for any of the other main UK industry sectors.
- The creative industries accounted for 1.68 million jobs in 2012, 5.6 percent of the total number of jobs in the UK.
- Employment in the creative industries increased by 8.6 percent between 2011 and 2012, a much higher rate than for the UK economy as a whole (0.7 percent).
- The value of services exported by the creative industries was £15.5 billion in 2011, 8.0 percent of total UK service exports.

¹ Arts Council England, <u>The Value of Arts and Culture to People and Society: An Evidence Review</u>, Second Edition,

² Encyclopaedia Britanica, 'The Arts', accessed 17 November 2014, bold in original.

³ Department for Education, The National Curriculum in England: Framework Document, July 2014, p 8.

 Between 2009 and 2011, the value of service exports from the creative industries increased by 16.1 percent. This compares with an increase of 11.5 percent for total UK service exports.⁴

In addition, a March 2014 Arts Council England report set out some of the benefits of arts and culture to the UK economy. The report stated that one of these benefits was that in 2011, 10 million inbound visits to the UK involved engagement with the arts and culture, representing 32 percent of all visits to the UK and 42 percent of all inbound tourism-related expenditure.⁵

1.3 Number of Students Studying for Arts GCSE Qualifications

Department for Education statistical releases detail the number of students taking examinations at the end of key stage 4 in England over time. The number of students taking GCSE examinations in arts subjects are shown in the following table:⁶

	2007/ 2008	2008/ 2009	2009/ 2010	2010/ 2011	2011/ 2012	2012/ 2013	2013/ 2014
D & T: Electronic Products	13,442	11,906	10,957	9,853	9,140	8,498	8,320
D & T: Food Technology	72,520	66,725	62,104	54,049	49,524	43,426	40,591
D & T: Graphic Products	61,587	56,391	51,355	43,778	40,806	36,238	33,863
D & T: Resistant Materials	79,412	74,571	67,402	58,449	54,304	52,426	52,761
D & T: Systems & Control	7,448	6,212	5,637	4,328	4,060	3,483	3,236
D & T: Textiles Technology	41,500	39,772	35,835	33,657	31,984	27,760	25,592
Other Design and Technology	35,914	31,298	33,978	34,511	33,689	33,754	36,807
Applied Art and Design	-	-	-	1,476	1,171	1,051	847
Art and Design	186,164	175,592	169,298	162,342	159,012	164,510	169,512
Drama	93,870	86,254	80,765	74,755	70,371	69,754	69,845
Media/Film/TV	63,562	60,986	58,586	51,783	49,478	48,698	51,122
Media: Communication and Production	180	400	345	164	149	-	-
Music	53,831	48,012	45,433	43,157	40,761	41,256	41,890
Performing Arts	1,780	1,978	1,854	2,648	2,270	3,079	4,397

Source: Department for Education, 'Provisional GCSE and Equivalent Results in England: 2013 to 2014—Subject Time Series Tables: SFR41/2014', 21 October 2014.

⁴ Department for Culture, Media and Sport, '<u>Creative Industries Worth £8 million an Hour to UK Economy</u>', 14 January 2014.

⁵ Arts Council England, <u>The Value of Arts and Culture to People and Society: An Evidence Review</u>, Second Edition, March 2014, p 7.

⁶ Time series of GCSE results of pupils at the end of key stage 4 in schools, by subject (England) (2013/14 figures are provisional, all other years are final), Statistics on the grades awarded for each subject are available from the same source.

2. Reports on the Effects of Arts Education

The following section summarises a selection of the research available on the value of arts education, both in schools and more generally.

2.1 National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education Report, 1999

The National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education (NACCCE) was established in February 1998 by the then Department for Education and Employment and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport. The committee was chaired by Professor Ken Robinson of the University of Warwick, and included members from different professions and backgrounds, including science, the arts, education and business.⁷

In May 1999, the NACCCE published its report, All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education. In it, the committee made recommendations for provision in formal and informal education for young people to the age of 16, and included recommendations for a wider national strategy for creative and cultural education, which was defined more broadly than comprising only traditional fine arts subjects. In the words of the authors, the report, "put the case for developing creative and cultural education".8 The report stated:

Over a number of years, the balance of education, in our view, has been lost. There has been a tendency for the national debate on education to be expressed as a series of exclusive alternatives, even dichotomies: for example, as a choice between the arts or the sciences; the core curriculum or the broad curriculum; between academic standards or creativity; freedom or authority in teaching methods. We argue that these dichotomies are unhelpful. Realising the potential of young people, and raising standards of achievement and motivation includes all of these elements. Creating the right synergy and achieving the right balance in education is an urgent and complex task, from national policy making to classroom teaching.9

The report argued:

[...] that no education system can be world-class without valuing and integrating creativity in teaching and learning, in the curriculum, in management and leadership and without linking this to promoting knowledge and understanding of cultural change and diversity.10

Furthermore, the report argued that creative education was economically important. The report stated that businesses:

[...] want people who can adapt, see connections, innovate, communicate and work with others. This is true in many areas of work. The new knowledge-based economies in particular will increasingly depend on these abilities. Many businesses are paying for

⁷ National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education, All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education, May 1999, pp 3 and 14.

⁸ ibid, p 5.

⁹ ibid, p 9.

¹⁰ ibid, p 16.

courses to promote creative abilities, to teach the skills and attitudes that are now essential for economic success but which our education system is not designed to promote.¹¹

The authors of the report wrote that such a process of creative education "should begin in school". 12

2.2 National Foundation for Educational Research Report, 2000

In 1997, the Royal Society for the encouragement of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce brought together organisations, including the then Arts Council of England, BT and the Local Government Association, to co-fund research into arts education, commissioned from the National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER). Published in October 2000, the resulting report, Arts Education in Secondary Schools: Effects and Effectiveness, set out the findings of a three-year research project which had investigated the range of outcomes attributable to arts education in English and Welsh secondary schools, drawing on evidence collected through case studies of five secondary schools with "good reputations in the arts"; analyses of wide-ranging information compiled by NFER; questionnaires completed by over 2,000 students in 22 schools; and interviews conducted with a cross-section of 20 employers and some of their employees.

The report's authors wrote that, according to findings from their case studies, the effects of arts education fell into ten broad categories. Outcomes attributable to the arts comprised:

- a heightened sense of enjoyment, excitement, fulfilment and therapeutic release of tensions;
- an increase in the knowledge and skills associated with particular art forms;
- enhanced knowledge of social and cultural issues;
- the development of creativity and thinking skills;
- the enrichment of communication and thinking skills;
- advances in personal and social development;
- effects that transfer to other contexts, such as learning in other subjects, the world of work and cultural activities outside of and beyond school;
- effects on the local community (including parents and governors); and
- art itself as an outcome.¹³

The authors also noted that arts-orientated students in schools strong in the arts reported that each of the main art forms generated distinctive effects:

For example, dance offered increased awareness of the body and movement; art promoted expressive skills; drama nurtured empathy and the valuing of others; and music extended active listening skills.¹⁴

However, the authors reported that, according to findings from the wider sample, "there was no sound evidence to support the claim that the arts boost general academic performance at GCSE". This contrasted with the "volunteered accounts of arts-based learning that had

¹² ibid, p 61.

¹¹ ibid, p 14.

¹³ National Foundation for Educational Research, <u>Arts Education in Secondary Schools: Effects and Effectiveness</u>, October 2000, p 565.

¹⁴ ibid, p 566.

transferred to other subjects" from students at the case study schools. The authors concluded, therefore, that "overall, the findings add weight to the emerging literature that strikes a cautionary note on the alleged influence of the arts on general academic attainment". 15

Furthermore, another "significant finding" was:

[...] the limited impact of arts education on the generality of pupils in many schools. Most pupils in the Year II survey signalled that the arts had made no impact on them. Too often, only the most committed of pupils registered any effects, especially in music. Certainly in terms of technical capabilities, some pupils in the case study saw music as 'special' and for the elite. 16

The authors noted that their evidence "revealed marked differences" in the individual art forms studied. Art "achieved a wide variety of important effects on pupils, was the most likely to be perceived as having an impact, had the highest proportion of pupils taking it at key stage 4 and was afforded official status within the National Curriculum". Dance and drama both "registered an impressive array of outcomes for those pupils that took them, but both appeared to be lacking in status—in terms of curriculum coverage, the exposure that pupils received and their place within the National Curriculum". Music, "while benefitting from similar status to that of art, attracted the highest proportion of 'no impact' responses, registered a more limited range of outcomes compared with art and drama, had very low numbers enrolling for it at key stage 4 and, relative to other arts subjects, received lower levels of enjoyment in GCSE courses. Pupil enjoyment, relevance, skill development, creativity and expressive dimensions were often absent".17

However, according to the authors of the report, the arts were "seen by many members of senior management in schools to impact on the whole school ethos, mainly by encouraging a positive cohesive atmosphere through enhancing pupils' enjoyment, self-esteem and achievement". They continued:

While several senior teachers acknowledged that this made the arts particularly important in fostering a culture conducive to institutional change and development, they stressed that school improvement and effectiveness were dependent on many factors, including important contributions to the ethos of the school made by other areas of the curriculum. 18

2.3 United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation Report, 2003

The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) has stated that arts education:

[...] not only strengthens cognitive development and the acquisition of life skills innovative and creative thinking, critical reflection, communicational and inter-personal skills, etc—but also enhances social adaptability and cultural awareness for individuals,

¹⁵ ibid.

¹⁶ ibid, p 567.

¹⁷ ibid, pp 567–8.

¹⁸ ibid, p 568.

6

enabling them to build personal and collective identities as well as tolerance, acceptance and appreciation of others. 19

However, the UNESCO report, Road Map for Arts Education, published following the world conference on arts education held in Lisbon, Portugal in March 2006, stated:

It can be argued that creativity as expressed through culture is the world's most equitably distributed resource. However, research indicates that certain education systems can stifle creativity while others can promote it. The assumption is that arts education is one of the best media for nurturing creativity (when the methods of teaching and learning support it), but the mechanisms for this are not well documented and the argument is therefore not well received by policy makers. Further research into this area is therefore needed.²⁰

Ms Kaori Iwai, former Assistant Programme Specialist in the Section of Intangible Cultural Heritage at UNESCO, presented a paper entitled <u>The Contribution of Arts Education to Children's</u> Lives at the UNESCO regional meeting on arts education in Europe and North America, held in Helsinki, Finland, in 2003. In it, Ms Iwai summarised existing research relating to "how the arts contribute to education from five viewpoints: aesthetic development; socio-emotional development; socio-cultural development; cognitive development and academic achievement".21

Aesthetic Development

Citing studies conducted in Israel, the US, South Korea, Brazil and Chile, Iwai asserted that the appropriate introduction of arts education in curricula improved students' aesthetic development.²² Iwai stated that these studies showed, amongst other outcomes: that students who undertook visual arts activities with teacher supervision achieved a "significantly larger improvement of artistic development" compared with those who undertook such activities without teacher supervision; the variety of students' music compositional strategies were increased by "visual thinking" tools such as computer and graphic notations; and that children who were selected to participate in a play had "better knowledge and comprehension" of drama and a "positive attitude toward theatre arts" after taking part.

Socio-emotional Development

lwai asserted that "arts activities also enhance children's self-awareness, self-confidence and acceptance of others". 23 She stated that studies in various countries claimed to show that involvement in role-playing and story writing activities led to students showing "better attitudes of self-expression, trust, self-acceptance, acceptance of others, self-awareness and empowerment"; students enrolled in a programme that combined the study of literature and social studies with the arts showed "higher class attendance and significantly lower drop-out rate[s]" than non-enrolled students; and that students' study of the arts or participation in artsbased activities resulted in "greater motivation", "higher levels of class engagement" and "spiritual, moral, social and cultural development".

¹⁹ United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation, 'Arts Education', accessed 17 November 2014.

²⁰ United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation, Road Map for Arts Education, 2006, p. 12.

²¹ Kaori Iwai, The Contribution of Arts Education to Children's Lives, 2003, p 2.

²² ibid, pp 2–3.

²³ ibid, p 3.

Socio-cultural Development

In the report, Iwai stated that arts education led to children improving "their interpersonal skills such as teamwork skills, tolerance, appreciation of diversity in people and ideas, and effective communication ability". 24 Iwai further stated that several studies claimed to show that participation in cultural activities decreased students' "stereotypical attitudes", and improved students' "sense of identity".

Cognitive Development

Iwai reported that a Harvard University study had shown a "significant correlation" in the following three areas: "listening to music and spatial-temporal reasoning; learning to play music and spatial reasoning; and classroom drama and verbal skills". 25 Iwai reported that other studies claimed to show that music instruction improved children's abstract reasoning and perceptual skills. Furthermore, Iwai recorded that other studies claimed to show that students in a dance programme scored higher in tests in fluency, originality and imagination than those in a physical education programme, and that students participating in a fine arts programme improved their scores on tests of intelligence and creativity.

Academic Achievement

Iwai also recorded that a study by the Association for the Advancement of Arts Education found that "when the arts are connected in meaningful ways with other subject areas, students comprehend and retain more about the subjects involved". 26 She further stated that studies existed which showed that participation in arts activities enhanced students' academic attitude and aspiration; improved children's reading, writing and language skills; and improved students' test scores in subjects such as mathematics and history.

2.4 National Foundation for Educational Research Report, 2005

In 2001, the Arts Council of England and Regional Arts Boards²⁷ launched the Arts and Education Interface initiative, which aimed to explore the impact of artists working in educational settings through a programme of arts-based interventions organised in Bristol and Corby. NFER was commissioned to study these interventions, and published a report in 2005.²⁸

The study researched 15 interventions that took place during the academic years 2001/02 and 2002/03. The sample included a cross-section of schooling phases, different educational sectors and a range of art forms.²⁹ The authors stated that their report "brings a sound evidence-based methodology to bear upon the identification of features associated with successful or, more aptly, effective arts-education interventions".30

²⁴ ibid, p 6.

²⁵ ibid, p 7.

²⁶ ibid, p 9.

²⁷ The Arts Council of England and ten regional arts boards merged in 2002. Arts Council England, 'The History of the Arts Council', accessed 19 November 2014.

²⁸ National Foundation for Educational Research, <u>The Arts-Education Interface: A Mutual Learning Triangle?</u>, June 2005.

²⁹ ibid, p vii.

³⁰ ibid, p xv.

The authors listed outcomes of these arts-based interventions on pupils and young people; teachers, schools and host institutions; and artists and arts organisations. Most commonly, the authors found a higher impact from the arts-based interventions for pupils than for teachers, "who in turn generally received a higher impact rating than artists".³¹

Pupils and Young People

Regarding outcomes reported for pupils and young people following the arts-based interventions, the authors stated:

Eleven broad categories of effects for pupils and young people were identified. The most frequently and strongly reported of these were:

- affective outcomes such as enjoyment, pride and a sense of achievement;
- art form knowledge, appreciation, skills and techniques;
- personal development, especially self-esteem and self-confidence;
- social development, particularly teamwork and awareness of others.

There were mid-ranking levels of impact on developments in creativity, changes in attitudes towards the arts and transfer beyond the arts. The effects nominated least frequently and with limited intensity were knowledge and skills beyond the arts, social and cultural knowledge, thinking skills and communication and expressive skills [...]

Each of the art forms displayed distinctive configurations of outcomes for pupils. Comparatively, the visual arts engendered developments in creativity, aesthetic judgement making and interpretative skills more highly than any other art form. Dance was relatively strong on teamwork and physical wellbeing outcomes. Drama displayed the greatest potential for generating a wide array of effects, as well as for 'strong' impacts. Whilst music produced the narrowest range of effects, it was the only art form to stimulate impacts comparatively strongly in the realms of social and cultural knowledge.³²

The authors found that "gains in art form appreciation and confidence in their own art form ability were more prevalent among secondary school pupils than their primary counterparts" following arts-based interventions, "whilst primary schools monopolised knowledge, skills and appreciation beyond the arts as an outcome".³³

The authors noted that "one-off interventions resulted in a narrower range of reported effects than those where pupils experienced multiple phases". They posited that this "may point to the need for longer-term [arts-based] strategies that sustain and develop learning outcomes, as well as particular qualities such as self-esteem".³⁴

In addition, the authors wrote that the "array of outcomes in the personal domain" for students suggested an "important contribution for arts interventions in what many would see as the most fundamental aspect of young people's education: their emotional health". They also wrote that "there is good evidence that [arts-based] interventions also supported impacts on

³¹ ibid, p xi.

³² ibid, pp viii–ix.

³³ ibid, p ix.

³⁴ ibid.

young people's social development, including increased awareness and recognition that there is an equivalent centre of self in other people".35

Teachers, Schools and Host Institutions

Regarding outcomes reported for teachers, schools and host institutions following the artsbased interventions, the authors stated:

The most frequently nominated outcomes for teachers and schools across the range of interventions (pupil-focused and teacher-focused) were:

- enhanced knowledge and skills, particularly art form knowledge and skills in managing arts interventions;
- impacts on classroom practices, particularly modelling on the artists;
- institutional and strategic outcomes, chiefly in multi-phase interventions where sequential links were planned for.

Other outcomes for teachers comprised motivational and attitudinal (eg, enthusiasm to recreate artists' practices); affective outcomes (eg, enjoyment and confidence, although this could also be undermined) and new awareness (eg, seeing pupils or the art form in a new light).

In addition, for teachers involved in teacher-focused interventions, material and provisionary outcomes, on which they could draw following the interventions, were prevalent. Despite this, for all types of intervention, the extent to which teachers were able to make significant and sustained changes to their practice remained an open question.³⁶

2.5 Third Sector Research Centre Report, 2013

Researchers at the Third Sector Research Centre, based at the University of Birmingham, published a short report in August 2013 which considered factors that predicted volunteering among youths in the UK. 37 Using data from Understand Society, the UK household longitudinal study, they found that "youths who are high in cultural capital are also more likely to volunteer", 38

2.6 Arts Council England Report, 2014

In March 2014, Arts Council England, an executive non-departmental public body sponsored by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, published <u>The Value of Arts and Culture to People</u> and Society: An Evidence Review. In it, Sir Peter Bazalgette, chair of Arts Council England, stated:

The general value of arts and culture to society has long been assumed, while the specifics have just as long been debated. Try to imagine society without the humanising

³⁵ ibid, p xiv.

³⁶ ibid, p x.

³⁷ Third Sector Research Centre, Briefing Paper 102: What Factors Predict Volunteering Among Youths in the UK?, August 2013.

³⁸ ibid, p 3.

influence of the arts, and you will have to strip out most of what is pleasurable in life, as well as much that is educationally critical and socially essential.

Life without the collective resources of our libraries, museums, theatres and galleries, or without the personal expression of literature, music and art, would be static and sterile—no creative arguments about the past, no diverse and stimulating present and no dreams of the future.

Of course the inherent value of arts and culture is, in part, a philosophical assertion that can't be measured in numbers. Quantifying the benefits and expressing them in terms of facts and figures that can evidence the contribution made to our collective and individual lives has always presented a problem, but it is something that arts and culture organisations will always have to do in order to secure funding from both public and private sources.

[...] while we do not cherish arts and culture because of the impact on our social wellbeing and cohesion, our physical and mental health, our education system, our national status and our economy, they do confer these benefits and we need to show how important this is.³⁹

Sir Peter went on to state that "there is a considerable body of research literature available" on the value of arts and culture to people and society, but admitted "there are also many gaps". 40

One of the main objectives of the Art Council's review was to "assess the strength of the evidence base between 2010–13 about the economic, social, health and wellbeing, education, lifelong learning, and environmental impacts and outcomes of arts and culture in England". The authors used the following criteria to identify sources for inclusion:

- published since 2010;
- published in English;
- a research study, outcome or process evaluation based on scientific principles containing primary data gathered using sound methodologies or robust analyses of secondary data.

The authors stated that arts and culture were of value to education in the following ways:

- Taking part in drama and library activities improves attainment in literacy.
- Taking part in structured music activities improves attainment in maths, early language acquisition and early literacy.
- Schools that integrate arts across the curriculum in the US have shown consistently higher average reading and mathematics scores compared to similar schools that do not.
- Participation in structured arts activities increases cognitive abilities.

³⁹ Arts Council England, <u>The Value of Arts and Culture to People and Society: An Evidence Review</u>, Second Edition, March 2014, p 4.

⁴⁰ ibid.

⁴¹ ibid, p 10.

⁴² ibid, p 13.

Students from low income families who take part in arts activities at school are three times more likely to get a degree than children from low income families who do not engage in arts activities at school.⁴³

In addition, the report listed benefits derived from arts and culture for the economy, health and wellbeing, and society, two of which were relevant to the effect of arts education in schools:

- High-school students who engage in the arts at school are twice as likely to volunteer than those who don't engage in the arts and are 20 percent more likely to vote as young adults.
- Employability of students who study arts subjects is higher and they are more likely to stay in employment.44

3. Government Activity

It is government policy to "support vibrant and sustainable arts and culture". 45 As part of this policy, the Government has stated:

Arts and culture strengthen communities, bringing people together and removing social barriers. Involving young people in the arts increases their academic performance, encourages creativity and supports talent early on.⁴⁶

The Government published a policy paper on cultural education in July 2013. Background to this publication is set out below.

3.1 Cultural Education Policy Paper

In February 2011, the Department for Education and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport published an independent review into music education in the English school system written by Darren Henley, Managing Director of Classic FM. 47 In the report, Henley stated that he was "convinced of the positive effect that music, both as an academic subject, taught in the classroom, and as a participative activity, in and out of the classroom, can have on young people's lives". 48 The report made "recommendations for minimum expectations of what any child going through the system should receive in terms of an education in music", and outlined a "national plan, which lays down the expectations of how music education should develop over the coming years".49

Henley's review led to the Government publishing a policy paper, The Importance of Music: A National Plan for Music Education, in November 2011. This document set out the aims of the

⁴³ ibid, p 8.

⁴⁵ Department for Culture, Media and Sport and Department for Education, 'Supporting Vibrant and Sustainable Arts and Culture', accessed 18 November 2014.

⁴⁷ Department for Education and Department for Culture, Media and Sport, Music Education in England, February 2011.

⁴⁸ ibid, p 4.

⁴⁹ Department for Education and Department for Culture, Media and Sport, 'Music Education in England: A Review by Darren Henley for the Department for Education and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport', 7 February 2011.

national plan for music education and how the initiatives detailed in the plan would affect schools, local authorities and private music teachers.⁵⁰

Following this review, the then Secretary of State for Education, Michael Gove, and the then Minister for Culture, Communications and Creative Industries, Ed Vaizey, commissioned Darren Henley to conduct an independent review into cultural education in England. This review was completed in September 2012.⁵¹ In it, Henley declared that he believed "that all children can and should benefit from receiving a wide-ranging, adventurous and creative cultural education", and commented on the value of cultural education in schools:

The skills which young people learn from studying cultural education subjects help to ensure that the UK has over many years built up a creative and cultural industries sector which is, in many areas, world-beating. There is a clear message from the creative and cultural industries that the education which children and young people receive in school in creative and cultural subjects has a direct bearing on feeding into the talent pool for those who take up employment in this sector.⁵²

In its response to this second review, the Government stated that it shared Darren Henley's "vision for excellence in cultural education, to enable children from all backgrounds and every part of England to have the opportunity to experience and enjoy the best that our unique heritage has to offer". 53

One of the recommendations in Henley's review of cultural education, with which the Government agreed, was the need for a new national plan for cultural education, an "overarching strategy for the commissioning and delivery of cultural education in England". This recommendation, together with the earlier review into music education in England, fed into the Government's policy paper, <u>Cultural Education: A Summary of Programmes and Opportunities</u>, published in July 2013. In the foreword to this publication, Michael Gove and Ed Vaizey stated:

The arts are the highest form of human achievement. Through art we not only make sense of ourselves and the world, we also make our lives enchanted. Art allows us to celebrate our common humanity and communicate across boundaries. Artistic endeavour marks us out from the rest of nature as creators and celebrators of beauty.

That is why no education can be complete, indeed no programme of education can even begin, without making the arts and creativity central to a child's life [...] England's many successful schools put culture at the heart of their curriculum and we want all schools to be able to emulate, indeed surpass, those which are currently outstanding [...] We will encourage more schools to offer a wider spread of creative subjects with a new accountability framework for secondary schools [...]

The best schools do not operate in isolation, and provision of a good cultural education depends on the contribution of many other partners. This document sets out the contribution that government, arm's length bodies (ALBs) such as Arts Council England,

⁵⁰ Department for Education, 'The Importance of Music: a National Plan for Music Education', 25 November 2011.

⁵¹ Department for Education and Department for Culture, Media and Sport, <u>Cultural Education in England</u>, February 2012.

⁵² ibid, p 3.

⁵³ Department for Education and Department for Culture, Media and Sport, <u>Cultural Education in England: The Government Response to Darren Henley's Review of Cultural Education</u>, February 2012, p 2.

⁵⁴ ibid, p 4.

British Film Institute and English Heritage, and cultural education providers, as well as parents and pupils, can make, alongside schools.⁵⁵

The Government stated that it would "encourage universal access [for children] to high-quality cultural education, and demonstrate a stronger commitment to excellence in music, film and the arts". These commitments, it noted, would be "backed by £292 million of funding for cultural education activity over three years to March 2015". The Government further stated that an "organic change" was needed to achieve this, "with schools, local authorities, ALBs [arm's length bodies] and cultural education providers" needing to work together to "improve the quality of cultural education available to pupils".

3.2 National Curriculum

In its <u>Cultural Education</u> policy paper, published in July 2013, the Government stated that planned "curriculum and qualification reforms will secure high-quality teaching and qualifications in arts subjects". 57 A new statutory national curriculum for maintained schools in England was published in September 2013, following a review conducted in 2011. This review recommended that 'the arts' "should be made compulsory at Key Stage 4".58

The new curriculum came into effect for the majority of year groups from September 2014. The arts, defined as art and design, music, dance, drama and media arts, appeared across a number of curriculum areas, including art and design, design and technology, music and physical education.59

Arts subjects are compulsory in maintained schools in England until the age of 14.60 They are not compulsory national curriculum subjects after the age of 14, but all pupils in maintained schools in England have a statutory entitlement to be able to study an arts subject as part of their key stage 4 education.⁶¹

3.3 Qualification Changes

GCSEs and AS and A Levels

The Government is in the process of reforming GCSEs and A levels, to "ensure that they prepare students better for further and higher education, and employment". 62 Announcing the reform of arts GCSEs on 9 April 2014, the then Secretary of State for Education, Michael Gove, stated:

I am passionate about great art, drama, dance, music and design, and I am determined to ensure every child enjoys access to the best in our culture. I also want all schools to be able to nurture creative talent in every child.

⁵⁵ Department for Education and Department for Culture, Media and Sport, Cultural Education: a Summary of Programmes and Opportunities, July 2013, pp 3-4.

⁵⁶ ibid, p 9.

⁵⁷ ibid, p 8.

⁵⁸ Department for Education, *The Framework for the National Curriculum*, December 2011, p. 27.

⁵⁹ Department for Education, <u>The National Curriculum in England: Framework Document</u>, July 2014.

⁶⁰ ibid, p 7.

⁶¹ ibid, p 8.

⁶² Department for Education, Reformed GCSE and A Level Subject Content Consultation, July 2014, p 4.

That is why I am delighted that new high-quality qualifications in creative and cultural subjects will be made available to all students. They will now have the chance to take these new qualifications from September 2016.

This is fantastic news for cultural education in England's schools.⁶³

The reform of arts GCSEs was welcomed by Richard Hallam, chair of the Music Education Council; Deborah Annetts, chief executive of the Incorporated Society of Musicians, the subject association for music; Sir James Dyson and Darren Henley.⁶⁴

New subject content in art and design at AS and A level was published in April 2014, with the new qualifications scheduled to be taught from September 2015.⁶⁵ Between July and September 2014, the Government consulted on proposed subject content for GCSEs in art and design, dance and music, amongst other subjects, and AS and A levels in dance and music, amongst other subjects.⁶⁶ The Government is currently analysing feedback and plans to publish final content either later this year, or early next year.⁶⁷

In September 2014, the Government commented on its consultation:

We are now consulting on some of the remaining 2016 subjects: GCSEs in citizenship studies, cooking and nutrition, drama, and design and technology; and AS and A levels in drama and theatre. We plan to consult on GCSE and A level religious studies content later this year. AS and A level design and technology subject content requires further development to fully reflect the changes being introduced in the GCSE and will be introduced for first teaching in September 2017.⁶⁸

This consultation was scheduled to close on 20 November 2014.

In addition, Ofqual, a non-ministerial department that regulates qualifications, exams and tests in England and vocational qualifications in Northern Ireland, is consulting on the development of new GCSEs in design and technology and drama, and new A level and AS qualifications in drama and theatre, which are scheduled to be taught for the first time in September 2016.⁶⁹

English Baccalaureate

In September 2012, the Government announced that it intended to replace GCSEs in England with a new English Baccalaureate Certificate. However, following criticism of the proposals, the Government decided not to proceed with the planned reforms. The English Baccalaureate (EBacc) is now a performance measure, not a qualification, and is not compulsory. It was introduced in the 2010 performance tables. The measure recognises where pupils have secured a 'C' grade or better in GCSEs or accredited international GCSEs (iGCSEs) across a number of

⁶⁵ Department for Education, Reformed GCSE and A Level Subject Content Consultation, July 2014, p 4.

⁶³ Department for Education, 'New Arts GCSEs to be Introduced in 2016', 9 April 2014.

⁶⁴ ihid

⁶⁶ Department for Education, Reformed GCSE and A Level Subject Content Consultation, September 2014, p 4.

⁶⁷ Department for Education, 'GCSE and A Level Reform', accessed 18 November 2014

⁶⁸ Department for Education, Reformed GCSE and A Level Subject Content Consultation, September 2014, p 4.

⁶⁹ Ofqual, 'GCSEs, AS and A Levels: New Subjects to be Taught in 2016', accessed 18 November 2014.

⁷⁰ Telegraph, 'GCSEs Axed in Favour of 'English Baccalaureate Certificate', 17 September 2012.

⁷¹ BBC News, 'Planned Switch from GCSEs to Baccalaureate in England 'Abandoned', 7 February 2013.

⁷² Department for Education, 'English Baccalaureate: Information for Schools', 25 March 2014.

subjects—English, mathematics, two sciences, history or geography and a language (including Modern Foreign Languages (MFL) or ancient languages). By introducing this performance measure, the Government hoped that "more pupils will be offered the chance to take a broad core of more traditional academic options".73

A February 2013 study for the Department for Education by Ipsos MORI considered the effects of the English Baccalaureate in schools. The report stated:

Just under three quarters (73 percent) of teachers say that no subjects or courses have been withdrawn or failed to recruit enough pupils for the 2012/13 academic year because of the EBacc. Just over a quarter (27 percent) say that a subject or course has been withdrawn [...]

The most commonly withdrawn subject is drama or performing arts, with almost a quarter (23 percent) of teachers whose schools have withdrawn a subject saying that they no longer offer this. Around one in six (17 percent) say that art has been withdrawn, whilst around one in seven (14 percent) say that design or design technology has been withdrawn. Eleven percent say that textiles has been withdrawn.⁷⁴

Discount Codes

In March 2013, the Cultural Learning Alliance, a collective of over 9,000 individuals and organisations working across the arts, cultural, creative, education, youth and learning sectors reported that the Government had, in February, "changed regulations so that certain combinations of subjects would be 'discounted' in any league table. For example, these changes mean that only dance or drama can count towards league tables at GCSE, or only graphics or art and design". The network reported that "anecdotally teachers have told us that this it is already having a disproportionate effect on arts provision, with students now encouraged not to take more than one subject in each discipline". On 12 February 2014, Lord Nash, Parliamentary Under-Secretary at the Department for Education, stated that discount codes for drama and dance were being reviewed. ⁷⁶ In March 2014, the Cultural Learning Alliance reported that dance and drama GCSEs would not discount each other from 2015 in school performance tables, welcoming this as "really good news". 77 In June 2014, the National Society for Education in Art and Design reported that the Department for Education had agreed that art and design and photography GCSEs should be given separate discount codes.⁷⁸

Recent Developments

On 10 November 2014, the Telegraph reported that Nicky Morgan, Secretary of State for Education, had warned that "schoolchildren who focus exclusively on the arts and humanitiesstyle subjects risk restricting their future career path". 79 The paper reported that Morgan had

⁷³ Department for Education, 'The English Baccalaureate and GCSE Choices: Brief', 30 August 2011.

⁷⁴ Department for Education, Revised: The Effects of the English Baccalaureate, February 2013.

⁷⁵ Cultural Learning Alliance, 'Update on Education Reform Plans', 22 March 2013.

⁷⁶ HL Hansard, 12 February 2014, col 635.

⁷⁷ Cultural Learning Alliance, 'Dance and Drama Discount Code Change', 4 March 2014.

⁷⁸ National Society for Education in Art and Design, 'Change of Discount Codes for Art and Design and Photography Specifications', 18 June 2014.

⁷⁹ Telegraph, 'Nicky Morgan: Pupils 'Held Back' by Overemphasis on Arts', 10 November 2014.

stated that disciplines such as the sciences and maths open more doors for pupils than many subjects traditionally favoured by academic all-rounders. According to the *Telegraph*, Morgan stated that "the subjects to keep young people's options open are STEM subjects—science, technology, engineering and maths".

4. Opposition Position

Harriet Harman, Shadow Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport and Shadow Deputy Prime Minister, made a speech on young people and the arts at the Roundhouse in London on 9 June 2014. In it, she launched the Labour Party's consultation on young people and the arts, and stated that it was "every child's right to open up and explore their artistic and creative potential which should be a journey which goes on for the rest of their life". Harman added that creative and cultural learning "supports attainment in all subjects including in literacy and maths", and that research showed that "taking part in arts activities at school can make up for early disadvantage in terms of: likelihood to progress to further education; employment outcomes; and more general benefits, like participating in society through volunteering and voting". She added that cultural capital gained through engagement with the arts contributed to social mobility, and that the arts could benefit communities by helping those who "have gone off the rails" or are "suffering from mental illness".

Harman stated that, in her opinion, the Government was "going in the wrong direction" on art and culture, and that through its actions, the arts were in danger of becoming:

- more remote from children from working class backgrounds;
- more remote from young people in our disadvantaged communities;
- more remote from young people in our regions; and
- more the prerogative of a metropolitan elite.⁸¹

She added that the role of arts and culture in schools had been "downgraded" in the education system, and that there had been a "marked reduction in the participation of children in the arts" since May 2010. Citing the Government's <u>Taking Part</u> survey, Harman stated:

For primary school children, participation in arts activities is down by a third:

- music down from 55 percent to 36 percent;
- theatre and drama down from 49 percent to 33 percent;
- dance down from 45 percent to 29 percent; and
- visits to a heritage sites have declined.

In a third of all museums, visits from school children have decreased.

And, the whole government narrative around the Ebacc [English Baccalaureate], which the arts community fought so valiantly against, sent a damaging signal to downgrade the arts in education.

⁸⁰ Labour Press, 'Speech on Young People and the Arts by Harriet Harman', 9 June 2014.

⁸¹ ibid.

So now the number of children sitting arts GCSEs is declining. Since the election...

- music down 9 percent;
- drama down 13 percent;
- film excluded from the curriculum altogether.

They've cut teacher training places in arts education by 35 percent, and the numbers of specialist arts teachers has fallen. This makes no sense in terms of the arts and our creative industries, but it makes no sense in wider educational terms either. We reject the binary choice between science and arts. We need our young people to grow up to be problem solvers—to be creative and analytical—to become innovative and inquiring in their chosen profession. The STEAM subjects—science, technology, engineering, arts and maths—in combination are more than the sum of their parts.⁸²

Harman went on to state that one of the "key questions" in Labour's consultation was what role Ofsted should play in ensuring high standards in creative learning activity in every school. "Should a school be able to be rated as outstanding if it doesn't provide an outstanding cultural education?".83 Harman further stated that responses to the Labour consultation on young people and the arts would feed in to the Labour Party's manifesto for the 2015 general election.

In a foreword to the consultation document, Tristram Hunt, Shadow Secretary of State for Education, stated:

As Andreas Schleicher, Director of Education and Skills at the OECD has said: "Because of rapid economic and social change, schools have to prepare students for jobs that have not yet been created, technologies that have not yet been invented and problems that we don't yet know will arise."

Preparing our children for the jobs of the future therefore, will become an ever more daunting challenge. That is why practically every other OECD country is drawing up broad educational frameworks with a stronger emphasis upon creativity, innovation and other "twenty-first century skills" alongside academic basics such as numeracy and literacy. With its narrowing of the curriculum assessment criteria, its devaluing of creative subjects within the performance criteria, and its inability to provide a meaningful cultural offer, the Coalition Government risks allowing our children to fall behind the rest of the world. In the face of increasing competition, where the value of a culturally rich education will become more not less pronounced, that is a gross dereliction of duty [...]

We know we need to be nurturing curious young citizens as well as equipping our young people with excellent qualifications because that, writ large, is what leads to a vibrant, more democratic society. Instilling a sense of cultural literacy and reflection is absolutely essential to achieving that, so all our young people need to participate in as wide a variety of excellent artistic, creative and cultural experiences as possible.84

⁸² ibid.

⁸⁴ Labour Party, Young People and the Arts: a Consultation, June 2014, p 3.

5. Sector Opinion

The views of a selection of arts organisations on government reforms to arts education in schools is set out below.

National Society for Education in Art and Design

Responding to the proposed subject content for the GCSE in art and design, the National Society for Education in Art and Design (NSEAD), a professional association and independent trade union, stated:

Whilst NSEAD is broadly supportive of the principles for content set out in the specialist areas of study and their link to progression pathways into the creative, media and design industries, there is some concern at the lack of clarity on the percentage of specialist knowledge and content uniquely relevant and distinctive to each course title. Similarly, this distinctive content and knowledge will require media specific criteria and assessment. The emphasis placed on practical learning in the subject seems also to undervalue the critical and theoretical study, and the importance of first-hand learning from creative practitioners and industries, galleries and museums. We anticipate the outcomes of the consultation will ensure experts in both the classroom and the creative and cultural sectors can further shape a vibrant and relevant offer for our young people.85

Published in July 2014, the NSEAD Art, Craft and Design Educator Survey Report 2014 used surveys of 172 NSEAD members and supporters to plot the "impact of current government policy on art, craft and design education". 86 It reached the following conclusions:

- Performance measures that exclude or marginalise art, craft and design are impacting on key stage 3-4 provision, pupil choice, gallery and museum visits, specialist staff, professional development and the perceived value of the subject in state schools.
- Fewer specialist art, craft and design teachers are being trained. Non-specialist staff are teaching art, craft and design lessons and significant numbers of specialists in post rarely or never receive professional development.
- Opportunities for pupils to work with creative practitioners or to engage with original works of art, craft and design in galleries and museums have been reduced.
- Art, craft and design teachers report their subject is not always highly valued by senior staff and governors in maintained schools. Again, this is a picture not reflected in the independent sector.
- Learning opportunities for pupils in art, craft and design at key stages 3 and 4 in many state schools have reduced significantly. This is not the case in independent schools, where curriculum entitlement and choice has been sustained.87

⁸⁵ National Society for Education in Art and Design, 'DfE are Consulting on GCSE Art and Design Content', 16 July 2014.

⁸⁶ National Society for Education in Art and Design, <u>Art, Craft and Design Educator Survey Report 2014,</u> 2 July 2014, p 1. ⁸⁷ ibid, p 2.

Commenting on the report, Arts Professional, the "UK's leading arts management magazine"88, stated:

Policy changes that have led to the erosion of the arts in schools include the introduction of the English Baccalaureate, which is considered to discourage higher ability students from taking practical subjects; discount codes, which limit the number of arts subjects pupils can take at GCSE; and Progress 8 which places double weighting on maths and English, leading to schools taking lesson time away from arts subjects. More than a third of secondary schools have reduced the time allocated to the arts over the last three years, while budget cuts have led to schools having to charge pupils for materials. One [survey] respondent said: "We no longer deliver lessons that require expensive materials, for example, textiles at KS3".89

Prior to this report, the NSEAD had published A Manifesto for Art, Craft and Design Education, which sought to "celebrate, signpost and position our subject within the context of seven research evidenced policy proposals to ensure a world-class art, craft and design education for all our communities of learners".90

Cultural Learning Alliance

In May 2014, the Cultural Learning Alliance stated that Department for Education figures showed that hours of arts teaching and the number of arts teachers had fallen in secondary schools in England since 2010. The Alliance stated:

Even bearing in mind that the number of pupils in secondary schools is falling—pupil numbers have dropped by 68,365 or 2 percent since 2010, the arts are experiencing a disproportionate decline in provision.

- Design and Technology is experiencing the greatest decline with 11 percent fewer teachers and hours of teaching.
- Drama teacher numbers have fallen by 8 percent and the hours taught by 4 percent. These hours include teaching time from non-specialists.
- Art and Design teachers have declined by 4 percent with a reduction of 6 percent in teaching hours.

Music is the only arts subject to have seen a decline in numbers similar to the decline in pupil numbers with 3 percent less teachers and 2 percent less teaching hours.⁹¹

The Alliance added that the "decline in arts subjects in England's schools is especially worrying given the wide ranging transferrable skills children gain from studying the arts".92

Recent press coverage

In January 2013, an article in the Guardian reported that non-English Baccalaureate subjects were at risk of being "marginalised" following the proposed government reforms, "with the

⁸⁸ Arts Professional Twitter Profile.

⁸⁹ Arts Professional, 'Damning Report Reveals Impact of Policy Changes on Arts Education', 18 July 2014.

⁹⁰ National Society for Education in Art and Design, A Manifesto for Art, Craft and Design Education, February 2014.

⁹¹ Cultural Learning Alliance, 'Hours of Arts Teaching and Number of Arts Teachers Fall in England's Secondary Schools', 12 May 2014.

⁹² ibid.

creative arts lobby particularly vocal". A petition against the reforms "put together by the National Union of Teachers and National Association of Head Teachers", had the "support of I0 unions plus a host of bodies including the vocational charity the Edge Foundation, which is chaired by the Conservative former education secretary Lord Baker; the chair of the Council for Subject Associations; the leader of the largest sponsor of academies; the National Governors' Association; and the Professional Footballers' Association". The newspaper reported that the "plans as they stand will fail to recognise the talents of all pupils and will 'damage the economic and cultural health of the nation". The Government decided not to proceed with the planned reforms the following month.

In June 2014, the *Telegraph* reported that Sir Peter Bazalgette, chair of Arts Council England, had "lamented why a disproportionate number of people from top private schools like Eton had made a success of acting". ⁹⁴ The paper further reported that Bazalgette had stated that he "would like the Government to require inspectors to mark down state schools which did not have good drama facilities".

Also in June 2014, the *Financial Times* reported that several large companies, including Samsung, Facebook, ESPN and Steinway, had approached the Rhode Island School of Design (RISD) in the US, "hoping to team up with students to tackle a particular problem". ⁹⁵ Rosanne Somerson, RISD's president, stated that the ability to step back from a process and rethink it entirely often requires an artist's mind: "artists and designers don't just solve problems, they reframe questions". The paper reported that politicians and policy makers were "increasingly open to the idea that art education ought to be part of a renewed focus in schools on science, technology, engineering and maths".

In an article on the film *Art Party* by Bob and Roberta Smith, Emily Chan wrote in the *Telegraph* in August 2014 that figures suggested there was a 14 percent drop in the number of children taking arts subjects in 2013, compared to 2010. ⁹⁶ Chan reported that in Smith's opinion, this was a result of the Government's education reforms and focus on the EBacc.

⁹³ Guardian, 'Education in Brief: Does Anyone Think the Ebacc is a Good Idea?', 7 January 2014.

⁹⁴ Telegraph, 'Too Many Top Male Actors Went to Public School, says Arts Council Chief', 20 June 2014.

⁹⁵ Financial Times, 'Art Offers Manufacturing Fresh Perspectives', 17 June 2014.

⁹⁶ Telegraph, "The Tragedy of Gove": the Film that Predicted his Downfall", 20 August 2014.